(Hon. Members then stood in silence for one minute.)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Secretary-General will convey to the members of the bereaved family our deep sense of sorrow and sympathy.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

ISI activities in Kashmir Valley

*381. SHRI VIJAY J. DARDA:†
SHRIMATI SHOBHANA BHARTIA:

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

(a) whether irrespective of Government's peace initiative and Prime Minister's invitation to Kashmiri separatist leaders for round table conference, ISI refuses to stop its nefarious activities in valley;

(b) if so, whether according to reports, ISI is promoting three terrorist outfits and has directed the commanders of Laskhar-e-Tayeba and Al-Badar to continue attacks;

(c) whether ISI has increased remuneration to terrorist outfits as a reward for their activities;

(d) whether several attacks, bomb blasts and killing of tourists on 11th July and earlier are result of such activities; and

(e) whether this has forced India to delay proposed ministerial talks with Pakistan?

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL): (a) to (e) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

(a) to (d) According to available inputs, Pakistan ISI continues to provide directions and logistics support including recruitment, arms training and finances to terrorist outfits like Lashkar-e-Toiba (LeT), Jaish-e-Mohammed (JeM), Hizbul Mujahideen (HM) and Al-Badr for terrorist related activities in Jammu and Kashmir despite Government's peace

† The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Vijay J. Darda.

initiative and Prime Minister's invitation to separatist leaders for two Round Table Conferences.

Available inputs indicate Pakistan ISI continues to remunerate terrorists for attacks on security forces and political leaders. The serial grenade attacks on April 14 and July 11, 2006 in Srinagar city and killing of tourists are reportedly the result of directives received by the terrorist outfits from across the border.

(e) Emphasizing our commitment to the dialogue process, India has conveyed to Pakistan that the dialogue process can be sustained if Pakistan takes action for dismantling the infrastructure of terrorism, including training camps, launch pads and communication links between terrorist groups on the India side and their handlers on the Pakistan side. The Foreign Secretary level talks will take place at an appropriate time.

श्री विजय जे॰ दर्डा: सर, मैं मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूं कि भारत सरकार ने जो आतंकवादियों की लिस्ट सौंपी थी, उस पर पाकिस्तान ने क्या कार्यवाही की है? महोदय, उस लिस्ट के कुछ नाम जैश-ए-मोहम्मद और लश्कर-ए-तैयबा से संबंधित हैं। साथ ही अभी ब्रिटेन में पकड़े गए आतंकवादियों के साथ जुड़े हुए जो नाम हैं, विशेष रूप से यू॰एस॰ए॰ और ब्रिटेन से, उनके बारे में पाकिस्तान की क्या प्रतिक्रिया है? महोदया, इन गुर्टों ने हाल ही में एक टी॰वी॰ चैनल को दिए इंटरव्यू में दिल्ली, मुंबई और बंगलौर तथा अन्य ठिकानों पर हमलों की चेतावनी दी है। इस पर सरकार ने क्या कार्यवाही की है और क्या इस मामले को पाकिस्तान के साथ उठाया जाएगा?

श्री शिवराज वी॰ पाटिल: महोदय, हमारे देश भारत के गृह सचिव और पाकिस्तान के गृह सचिव मिलते हैं। उस में इन विषयों पर चर्चा हुई है और जो लिस्ट हम ने उनको दी है, उस पर भी चर्चा हुई है। वह भी कभी-कभी हम को कुछ कागज देते हैं। जहां तक सारे नामों का सवाल है, वे सारे नाम Tally होते हैं या नहीं होते हैं, वे पूरी लिस्ट देखने के बाद दिए हैं, लेकिन हम ने उनको बार-बार बताया है कि कुछ नाम तो ऐसे है जो सब के सामने हैं, सब की मालूमात के हैं। उन के बारे में कुछ दिक्कत नहीं होनी चाहिए, लेकिन उस के बाद भी उस के ऊपर पूरी तरह से कार्यवाही होती हम को नजर नहीं आती है। जहां तक लंदन में हुए हादसे की बात है तो उस में कौन से नाम हैं, नहीं हैं, वह अलग बात है, मगर यहां कुछ एक-दो लोगों के नाम भी उस में आए हुए हैं।

श्री विजय जे॰ दर्डा: सर, इंडो-नेपाल बॉर्डर पर आई॰एस॰आई॰ की गतिविधियां लगातार बढ़ नहीं हैं। पिछले दिनों देखने में आया है कि आई॰एस॰आई॰ या तो इंडो-नेपाल बॉर्डर से या बांग्लादेश के रास्ते से आतंकवादियों को भेज रही है। इंडो-नेपाल बॉर्डर पर रक्सौल तथा अन्य क्षेत्रों में भी अभी 3 हजार से अधिक ऐसे लोग हैं, जिनका नाम इंडिया और नेपाल, दोनों की वोटर

लिस्ट में है। इन गतिविधियों पर काबू पाने के लिए सरकार क्या कर रही है? क्या सरकार ने नेपाल और बांग्लादेश के साथ लगने वाली सीमाओं के प्रदेशों की सरकारों तथा इंटेलिजेंस एजेंसियों के साथ चर्चा की है? अगर की है, तो भारत सरकार उस कॉरपोरेशन के साथ किस प्रकार से इंटेलिजेंस शेयरिंग कर रही है?

श्री शिवराज वी॰ पाटील: श्रीमन्, हमारी और नेपाल की जो ट्रीटी है, उसके मुताबिक वहां के लोग यहां पर और यहां के लोग वहां पर बिना वीजा के जा सकते हैं और आ सकते हैं। यह जो बॉर्डर है, उसके खुले होने की वजह से जो लोग आतंक पैदा करने के लिए या ऐसे ही कुछ काम करने के लिए आना चाहते हैं, उनको आसानी जरूर हो जाती है। इसलिए सरकार की ओर से हमने जो कदम उठाए हैं, वे इस प्रकार के हैं–

एक तो यह जो बॉर्डर है, वह एस॰ एस॰ बी॰ को दिया गया है और एस॰एस॰बी॰, जो हमारी फोर्स है, उसको दिया गया है। हमारे यहां उसकी 20 बटालियंस थीं, उसको हम करीब-करीब 40 बटालियन तक बढ़ा रहे हैं। उसकी संख्या बढ़ा रहे हैं। उसके ऊपर के जो पोस्ट्स हैं, हम उन पोस्ट्स की संख्या भी बढ़ा रहे हैं। दूसरे, स्टेट गवर्नमेंट की और हमारी जो केन्द्रीय इंटेलिजेंस एजेंसीज़ हैं, उनको भी कहा गया है कि उसका इंटेलिजेंस ज्यादा-से-ज्यादा पैमाने पर एकत्र करके वहां पर जो लोग हैं, उनको दिया जाए। इसके साथ ही यह बात नेपाल की सरकार के साथ चर्चा में भी उठाई गई है और उसके ऊपर चर्चा हुई है।

श्री विजय जे॰ दर्डा: सर, ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: नहीं, अब नहीं ...(व्यवधान)... हो गया, क्वेश्चन। हो गया। अब नहीं ...(व्यवधान)... श्रीमती शोभना भरतिया जी ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री विजय जे॰ दर्डा: सर, मेरे एक प्रश्न का उत्तर ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: नहीं, अब क्वेश्चन नहीं ...(व्यवधान)... दो कर लिए ...(व्यवधान)... बुरी आदत न पड़ जाए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री विजय जे॰ दर्डा: नहीं, सर, मैंने यह पूछा था कि आतंकवादियों के खिलाफ जो ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: वह ठीक है, ठीक है ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री विजय जे॰ दर्डा: उसमें यू॰ एस॰ और ब्रिटेन की क्या प्रतिक्रिया है? ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: वे आपको बता देंगे।

SHRIMATI SHOBHANA BHARTIA: Sir, as part of the larger composite dialogue, when on the 30th of May, the Home Secretary level

talks happened, India had apparently given specific names of 59 terrorist cells in PoK and another 8 or 9 were to be given. I want a specific answer, has Pak responded to that? How many cells have been disbanded since then? When we have these terrorist attacks, they are using very hi-tech gadgets like mobiles and Internet servers. Most of these servers are in the United States and are privately owned. What arrangement do we have to get the data easily, in a timely manner?

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, I have already said that when the Home Secretaries of both the countries meet, they do exchange some documents. We have given them the document pointing out the places where according to our information, training is imparted to terrorists on the Pak territory. They are also doing the same thing. When we give them the papers, they keep denying that those kinds of activities are not carried on the Pak territory. when we point it out to them that these activities are going on, this kind of denial is given to us. But, at times, they say that if you insist on our investigating further, we will do that. But the results have not been very satisfactory. We have not received any information on the dismanting of these kinds of faciliities on the Pak territory. On this point, we are not satisfied.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, this reply that the hon. Home Minister has given sets at rest any doubt, if ever there was any, that Pakistan continues to be involved in terrorist attacks from across the border and across the Line of Control in Indian territory including Jammu and Kashmir. Sir, in the light of this, the hon. Home Minister has just informed us that Pakistan is in a demial mode and whatever information we share with them they continue to deny that. My specific question is this. About the recent incidents of terrorist attacks, about which you have evidence. Pakistan has clearly said that they would want India to given evidence. This was the demand which was supported by the USA also. Now, we have called off the Foreign Secretary level talks, and the reply says, "They will take place at an appropriate time", which we all know is a bureaucratic reply for postponing it indefinitely. But my supplementary is this. As far as the recent incidents are concerned, if they have not been brought to their notice through the Foreign Secretary level talks or the Home Secretary level talks which have also, of course, not taken place, then, how have we shared the evidence with Pakistan? Have we shared them through diplomatic channels? Then, Sir, yesterday, according to media reports,

one terrorist was killed in Mumbai, and another was arrested; and, they were Pakistani nationals. Now, have all this information been brought, recently, over the last few days, to the notice of the Pakistani authorities, through diplomatic channels, and to the notice of the international community? If so, what is the response of Pakistan and the international community?

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, what has happened in Mumbai yesterday is being investigated carefully. The initial information is that those two persons against whom we took action—one of them had been killed and another had been arrested—are nationals of Pakistan. This information is with us. We would like to go into the greater details of the identity, papers and all those things and, defintely, this information will be shared with Pakistan. Whenever meetings take place, this will be sent to them. It becomes necessary to send the information before meetings take place. This information can be sent to them through the External Affairs Ministry, or, by another method of sharing this information ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Has it been sent? I specifically asked whether it has been sent. This is about the recent incidents.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Don't expect us; yesterday, in the evening ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: No; no; not of yesterday's. I am taking about the incidents referred to in this reply, namely, the attack on the tourists in Srinagar and the Mumbai bomb blasts.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: On the Mumbai bomb blasts, we have some information. But we would not like to jump to any conclusion ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, I am sorry; the Minister is contradicting what he has said in this reply ...(*Interruptions*) He is contradicting what he has said in this reply. "All available inputs indicate that Pakistan's ISI continues to remunerate terrorist attacks on security forces and political leaders"...

SHRI SHVIRAJ V. PATIL: I am willing to reply to any of his questions, and he should have the patience of allowing me to complete my reply. If there is any other supplementary, I will reply to that also. But every two minutes, if he gets up, I won't be able to complete it. The hon. Member

was asking me as to whether the information relating to the incident which has been place yesterday was passed on ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I asked about the recently incidents.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: You formulate your supplementary, and I will reply. Sir, my understanding is that he wanted to know about the information regarding that incident. As far as the information about other incidents committed by persons coming from the other side of the border is concerned, some information has been given to them, and some information, which is not yet full and complete, we would like to give that piece of information on completing the investigation. Now, this is my reply. But if that supplementary relates to what happened yesterday, I have answered that.

श्री अबू आसिम आज़मी: सभापति जी, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूं कि क्या सरकार की जानकारी में यह बात है कि बेरोजगारी, जुल्म और नाइंसाफी जो एक कम्युनिटी के साथ लगातार हो रही है, इसका फायदा उठाकर आई॰एस॰आई॰ बेरोजगार नौजवानों को अपने आतंकवादी संगठन में भरती कर रही है? जहां सरकार अपने स्पेशल अधिकारी को पन्द्रह सौ रुपए मासिक वेतन दे रही है, वहीं आतंकवादी संगठन साढ़े सात हजार रुपये, और उससे अधिक का वेतन दे रहे हैं? क्या सरकार को इसकी जानकारी है? पिछले दो सालों में कितने आतंकवादी मारे गए हैं और कितने आतंकवादी गिरफ्तार किए गए हैं? यह मैं मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूं। ...(व्यवधान)

شری ابو عاصم اعظمی: سبھا پتی جی، میں مانئے منتری جی سے جاننا چاہتا ہوں کہ کیا سرکار کی جانکاری میں یہ بات ہے کہ بےروزگاری، ظلم اور ناانصافی جو ایک کمیونٹی کے ساتھہ لگاتار ہو رہی ہے، اس کا فائدہ اٹھا کر آئی۔ایس۔آئی۔ بیروزگار نوجوانوں کو اپنے آتنک وادی سنگٹھن میں بھرتی کر رہی ہے؟ جہاں سرکار اپنے اسپیشل ادھیکاری کو 1500 روپے ماہوار ویتن دے رہی ہے، وہیں آتنک وادی سنگٹھن ساڑھے سات ہزار روپے، اور اس سے زیادہ کا ویتن دے رہے ہیں؟ کیا سرکار کو اس کی جانکاری ہے؟ پچھلے دو سالوں میں کتنے آتنک وادی مارے گئے ہیں اور کتنے آتنک وادی گرفتار کئے گئے ہیں؟ یہ میں منتری جی سے جاننا چاہتا ہوں۔ ...مداخلت...

†Transliteration of Urdu Script.

श्री सभापति: यह अलग क्वेश्चन है। ...(व्यवधान)

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद: यह रेट आपको कैसे मालूम है? ...(व्यवधान)

श्री सभापति: यह अलग क्वैश्चन है।

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, as regards the question as to why some individuals take to arms and become terrorists, there are many reasons for it, and one of the reasons can be poverty. But to say that it is only because of poverty that this is happening amounts to not understanding the issue in the correct form. And beyond a limit, if we try to emphasise on this point, we may appear to be suggesting certain things which may not be very helpful to controlling these activities, but rather encouraging these activities.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Sir, of late, there has been reports that the ISI-linked terrorists have spread their tentacles even upto the Southern States, including Kerala. Has the Central Government any information about that? If so, kindly reveal it.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, I have said many times in this House, in the other House and outside also that we have information that the terrorists are not active only in the areas on the border, near the border, but they are spreading to different parts of our country. This information is available with us. They are coming not only from the other side of the border, but they are going to the other countries and also trying to enter into our country. They are taking the sea route also. And they are spreading also. This information is available with us. This information has been shared with the State Governments. We are careful in sharing this information because once something of this kind is stated on the floor of the House and it is discussed beyond a limit, a reasonable limit, it creates the terror. And, we do not want that kind of terror should be created. ...(*Interruptions*)... But, the fact remains, they are spreading to different parts of the country. We have sensitised the State Governments, and we have asked them to collect more information through the State police, and whatever information we have at the national level, we are sharing it with the State police.

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is not the first time that this type of a question is being put in the House. It is proved beyond doubt that Pakistan is behind the activities of these terrorists. Sir, I also remember that the previous Government had taken a strict stand that unless and until the attacks—may be by way of bombing or any other type of attacks—are stopped, the diplomatic relations or all other relations will be severed with Pakistan. I want to know from the hon. Minister whether this Government is also considering of giving a strict warning to Pakistan that if such attacks continue, we will severe all types of relations with that country.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, I am sorry that I don't have the information that the previous Government wanted to severe the relations with Pakistan because of this. I don't have this kind of information. ...(*Interruptions*)... I don't think that was the stand taken by the previous Government. But, well the hon. Members who are sitting here were part of the previous Government and they also know that this kind of an extreme stand was not taken by the previous Government. Of course, they had made certain statements to the extent of saying that आर-पार...

श्री मोती लाल वोरा: आर-पार की लड़ाई।

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Yes.

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): Hot pursuit.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Hot pursuit or आर-पार ...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We had withdrawn our High Commissioner from Islamabad. That is a matter of history.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: This is very unfair. ...(*Interruptions*)... This is unfair.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: No, no; if you are not aware of the fact, Mr. Minister, ...(*Interruptions*)... you ask those of us who were in the Government to tell you, we had withdrawn our High Commissioner from Islamabad.

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI: This warning was given a number of times in the House. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, I am not blaming the previous Government. I don't think that we, who are sitting here, should have an attitude which is partisan on foreign policy or defence policy or any policy of this nature. Now, when the previous Government had said, आर-पार की लड़ाई, we had said that what had happened—the hon. Member was sitting on the Chair—I was speaking at that time—and when they had said that 'आर-पार की लड़ाई होनी चाहिए,'—the attack on the Parliament was too serious, and yet whether we should talk in terms of आर-पार की लड़ाई or not is a question to be decided by a responsible Government. ...(*Interruptions*)... So, Sir, I am not blaming the previous Government; I am not saying that what they did was wrong or right. Now, in the circumstances, whatever they had to say, they had said. Even today, the hon. Prime Minister, before going to other countries and immediately after that did make a statement saying that 'if you want to have good relations, you cannot continue to support the terrorist activities against this country; you can't take a stand of that nature, support the terrorist activities and talk in terms of peace agreement, this and that'. That kind of a statement was made. Here also, the Foreign Secretaries were going to meet and we said that in such an atmosphere it cannot be done. But, at the same time, some hon. Members in the House very rightly said, do not take this kind of a stand, that we take a stand and the talks should continue. And the Government did say, "Look, we are unhappy, we are angry and we do feel that this should have been stopped and this should not have been done." This is expressed and the entire country, this House and the Government cannot certainly be happy with the incidence of the nature which happened in Mumbai. Yet, at the same time, as a mature democracy, Government and country, we shall have to take such steps which will really help in controlling the situation and not escalating any differences or any difficulties between the countries.

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Sir, in spite of our best efforts in good faith to restore relationship with Pakistan, their intention seems to be different. The Government has got it confirmed that the Pakistan's ISI has got a role in all this cross border terrorism activities in the country. My request is that the U.S. is friendly to us, they are more interested in the development of this country, they have been trying to provide energy security so that we can achieve nine per cent growth rate, and, I do not think, the U.S. policy of eradicating terrorism at the global-level is country-

specific. When such is the case, is there any proposal or any contemplation on the part of the Government to take up this issue with the U.S.? In my opinion, the U.S. alone can control Pakistan is not financing the ISI because the ISI is encouraging all this cross-border terrorism in this country.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, terrorism has become a world phenomenon and the people in different parts of the world have recognised the need to cooperate with each other. That is why the matter was discussed in the United Nations, the matter has been discussed with many countries and we have entered into agreements with more than 25 countries to cooperate in different manners to help and see that the terrorism is controlled by exchanging information, by helping each other in many, many other ways—by stopping the flow of funds from one country to the other and all those things. The big countries, certainly, which have suffered also, are willing to cooperate and we appreciate it. And we will definitely cooperate with all countries, take cooperation from them, give cooperation to them; but, at the same time, we will rather depend on ourselves more than any other country.

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: But, the U.S. for your information, Mr. Minister, has written off the debt of Pakistan. It is helping Pakistan militarily also.

DR. FAROOQ ABDULLAH: Sir, thank you for giving me an opportunity. I would like to know from the hon. Home Minister whether it is a fact that the ISI is not financed by the Pakistan Government but is financed by the drug money. Does the Government of India have any information on this fact? Is it a fact that it is not only the ISI that is financing on India, there are also other countries who have been spying on India, and a fact has been known before also that our R&AW man is in America? Is that also a fact?

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL: Sir, I have no information that the ISI is funded by the drug money or not. This is a Government organisation, naturally, I think, the funds might be given to this organisation by the Government itself and I do not have information on that.

Collecting the information and using the information is one thing. As far as instigating terrorist activities in other countries is concerned, it is something different. We shall have to distinguish between these two kinds of activities. I would not rather like to stand up here and criticise

this organisation or that organisation, left and right and say that you are wrong and we are right and things like that. Information about the activities of this organisation is known to the hon. Members and we are in a position to form our opinion in a correct manner and we have formed our opinion in a correct manner and we will be careful and we would like to be effective also.

Delay in finalisation of Defence Plans

*382. SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:†
SHRI HARISH RAWAT:

Will the Minister of DEFENCE be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that the finalization of Tenth Defence Plan was delayed;

(b) if so, the reasons therefor;

(c) whether Government have taken cognizance of the media reports apprehending delay in Eleventh Defence Plan too;

(d) if so, does Government agree with media reports;

(e) if so, reasons for the delay;

(f) whether it is a fact that inter-service rivalry has been one of the causes of delay in finalizing the Defence Plans; and

(g) if so, what steps are being taken to finalise the Defence Plan in time?

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): (a) to (g) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

The Tenth Defence Plan projections were formulated by the Ministry of Defence and an overall Plan size was accepted by the Ministry of Finance in December 2004 subject to the actual allocation for Defence being dependent largely on resources available with the Government at the relevant point of time, capacity to utilize funds, pace of expenditure, contractual agreements and other committed liabilities.

The Government is aware of the media report apprehending delay in finalization of Eleventh Defence Plan but does not agree with the

† The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Santosh Bagrodia.